

## RIBBLE VALLEY BOROUGH COUNCIL REPORT TO ACCOUNTS AND AUDIT COMMITTEE

Agenda Item No 6

meeting date: 16 NOVEMBER 2016  
 title: EXTERNAL AUDITOR APPOINTMENT – 2018/19 ONWARDS  
 submitted by: DIRECTOR OF RESOURCES  
 principal author: LAWSON ODDIE

### 1 PURPOSE

- 1.1. To decide the method for appointing the Council's external auditors from 2018/19 and make recommendation to Full Council.
- 1.2. Relevance to the Council's ambitions and priorities:
- Community Objectives – none identified.
  - Corporate Priorities - to continue to be a well-managed council, providing efficient services based on identified customer need.
  - Other Considerations – none identified.

### 2 BACKGROUND

- 2.1. The Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 (the Act) brought to a close the Audit Commission and established transitional arrangements for the appointment of external auditors and the setting of audit fees for all local government and NHS bodies in England. On 5 October 2015 the Secretary of State Communities and Local Government (CLG) determined that the transitional arrangements for local government bodies would be extended by one year to also include the audit of the accounts for 2017/18.
- 2.2. The Act also set out the arrangements for the appointment of auditors for subsequent years, with the opportunity for authorities to make their own decisions about how and by whom their auditors are appointed. Regulations made under the Act allow authorities to 'opt in' for their auditor to be appointed by an 'appointing person'.
- 2.3. In July 2016 Public Sector Audit Appointments (PSAA) were specified by the Secretary of State as an appointing person under regulation 3 of the Local Audit (Appointing Person) Regulations 2015. The appointing person is sometimes referred to as the sector led body and PSAA has wide support across local government. PSAA was originally established to operate the transitional arrangements following the closure of the Audit Commission under powers delegated by the Secretary of State. PSAA is an independent, not-for-profit company limited by guarantee and established by the LGA.
- 2.4. PSAA is inviting the Council (Annex 1) to opt in, along with all other authorities, so that PSAA can enter into a number of contracts with appropriately qualified audit firms and appoint a suitable firm to be the Council/Authority's auditor.
- 2.5. The principal benefits from such an approach are as follows:
- PSAA will ensure the appointment of a suitably qualified and registered auditor and expects to be able to manage the appointments to allow for appropriate groupings and clusters of audits where bodies work together;
  - PSAA will monitor contract delivery and ensure compliance with contractual, audit quality and independence requirements;
  - Any auditor conflicts at individual authorities would be managed by PSAA who would have a number of contracted firms to call upon;

- It is expected that the large-scale contracts procured through PSAA will bring economies of scale and attract keener prices from the market than a smaller scale competition;
- The overall procurement costs would be lower than an individual smaller scale local procurement;
- The overhead costs for managing the contracts will be minimised through a smaller number of large contracts across the sector;
- There will be no need for the Council/Authority to establish alternative appointment processes locally, including the need to set up and manage an 'auditor panel', see below;
- The new regime provides both the perception and reality of independent auditor appointment through a collective approach; and
- A sustainable market for audit provision in the sector will be easier to ensure for the future.

2.6. The Council's current external auditor is Grant Thornton UK LLP, this appointment having been made under a contract let by the Audit Commission. Following closure of the Audit Commission the contract was novated to PSAA, and since this date PSAA has demonstrated its capability in terms of auditor appointment, contract management, and monitoring audit quality.

2.7. Over recent years authorities have benefited from a reduction in fees in the order of 55% compared with fees in 2012. This has been the result of a combination of factors including new contracts negotiated nationally with the audit firms and savings from closure of the Audit Commission. The Council's current external audit fees for the main audit are £40,202 plus £6,690 for grant certification work.

2.8. The proposed fees for the subsequent years cannot be known until the procurement process has been completed, as the costs will depend on proposals from the audit firms.

2.9. The scope of the audit will still be specified nationally, the National Audit Office (NAO) is responsible for writing the Code of Audit Practice which all firms appointed to carry out the Council's audit must follow. Not all audit firms will be eligible to compete for the work, they will need to demonstrate that they have the required skills and experience and be registered with a Registered Supervising Body approved by the Financial Reporting Council.

2.10. Currently, there are only nine providers that are eligible to audit local authorities and other relevant bodies; all of these being firms with a national presence. This means that a local procurement exercise, as described immediately below, would seek tenders from these same firms, subject to the need to manage any local independence issues. Local firms could not be invited to bid.

### 3 OTHER OPTIONS

3.1. If the Council did not opt in there would be a need to establish an independent auditor panel. In order to make a stand-alone appointment the auditor panel would need to be set up by the Council itself. The members of the panel must be wholly or a majority of independent members as defined by the Act. Independent members for this purpose are independent appointees, this excludes current and former elected members (or officers) and their close families and friends. This means that elected members will not have a majority input to assessing bids and choosing which audit firm to award a contract for the Council's external audit.

- 3.2. Alternatively the Act enables the Council to join with other authorities to establish a joint auditor panel. Again this will need to be constituted of wholly or a majority of independent appointees (members). Further legal advice would be required on the exact constitution of such a panel having regard to the obligations of each Council under the Act and the Council would need to liaise with other local authorities to assess the appetite for such an arrangement.
- 3.3. Neither of these options are recommended. Both these options would be more resource-intensive processes to implement and without the bulk buying power of the sector led procurement, would be likely to result in a more costly service. It would also be more difficult to manage quality and independence requirements through a local appointment process.

#### 4 INVITATION FROM PSAA TO OPT IN

- 3.4. PSAA has now formally invited this Council to opt in. Details relating to PSAA's invitation are provided at Annex 2 to this report.
- 3.5. In summary the national opt-in scheme provides the following:
- The appointment of a suitably qualified audit firm for each of the five financial years commencing 1 April 2018;
  - Appointing the same auditor to other opted in bodies that are involved in formal collaboration or joint working initiatives to the extent this is possible with other constraints;
  - Managing the procurement process to ensure both quality and price criteria are satisfied. PSAA will seek views from the sector to help inform its detailed procurement strategy;
  - Ensuring suitable independence of the auditors from the bodies they audit and managing any potential conflicts as they arise;
  - Minimising the scheme management costs and returning any surpluses to scheme members;
  - Consulting with authorities on auditor appointments, giving the Council/Authority the opportunity to influence which auditor is appointed;
  - Consulting with authorities on the scale of audit fees and ensuring these reflect scale, complexity and audit risk; and
  - Ongoing contract and performance management of the contracts once these have been let.

#### 4 NEXT STEPS

- 4.1. Regulation 19 of the Local Audit (Appointing Person) Regulations 2015 requires that a decision to opt in must be made by a meeting of the Council (meeting as a whole). The Council then needs to formally respond to PSAA's invitation in the form specified by PSAA by early March 2017.
- 4.2. PSAA will commence the formal procurement process after this date. It expects to award contracts in summer 2017 and consult with authorities on the appointment of auditors so that it can make an appointment by the statutory deadline of December 2017.

## 5 RISK ASSESSMENT

### 5.1. The approval of this report may have the following implications

- Resources – There is a risk that current external fees levels could increase when the current contracts end in 2018.

Opting-in to a national scheme provides maximum opportunity to ensure fees are as low as possible, whilst ensuring the quality of audit is maintained by entering in to a large scale collective procurement arrangement.

If the national scheme is not used some additional resource may be needed to establish an auditor panel and conduct a local procurement. Until a procurement exercise is completed it is not possible to state what, if any, additional resource may be required for audit fees for 2018/19.

- Technical, Environmental and Legal – Section 7 of the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 requires a relevant Council/Authority to appoint a local auditor to audit its accounts for a financial year not later than 31 December in the preceding year. Section 8 governs the procedure for appointment including that the Council must consult and take account of the advice of its auditor panel on the selection and appointment of a local auditor.

Section 12 makes provision for the failure to appoint a local auditor: the Council must immediately inform the Secretary of State, who may direct the Council to appoint the auditor named in the direction or appoint a local auditor on behalf of the Council.

Section 17 gives the Secretary of State the power to make regulations in relation to an 'appointing person' specified by the Secretary of State. This power has been exercised in the Local Audit (Appointing Person) Regulations 2015 (SI 192) and this gives the Secretary of State the ability to enable a Sector Led Body to become the appointing person. In July 2016 the Secretary of State specified PSAA as the appointing person.

- Political – None identified
- Reputation – Such risk may arise from failure to appoint a local auditor. This risk is considered best mitigated by opting in to the sector led approach through PSAA.
- Equality and Diversity – When conducting procurement activities, the council must ensure that it meets its legal obligations under the Equality Act 2010 and its associated Public Sector Equality Duty.

## 6 CONCLUSION

6.1. The Council will need to take action to implement new arrangements for the appointment of external auditors from April 2018. In order that more detailed proposals can be developed the Council/Committee is asked to give early consideration to the preferred approach.

6.2. The Council has been asked by the LGA for an indication of the preferred approach in order that it can invest resources in providing appropriate support to Councils. The LGA is strongly supportive of the SLB approach as it believes this offers best value to Councils by reducing set-up costs and having to potential to negotiate lowest fees.

7 RECOMMENDED THAT COMMITTEE

- 7.1. Recommends to Full Council the acceptance of Public Sector Audit Appointments' (PSAA) invitation to 'opt in' to the sector led option for the appointment of external auditors for five financial years commencing 1 April 2018.

HEAD OF FINANCIAL SERVICES

DIRECTOR OF RESOURCES

AA26-16/LO/AC  
7 November 2016

**From:** [appointingperson@psaa.co.uk](mailto:appointingperson@psaa.co.uk) [<mailto:appointingperson@psaa.co.uk>]  
**Sent:** 27 October 2016 10:08  
**To:** Marshal Scott; Jane Pearson  
**Cc:** Diane Rice  
**Subject:** Ribble Valley Borough Council - Invitation to become an opted-in authority  
**Importance:** High

**Invitation to become an opted-in authority  
The Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 and the Local Audit (Appointing  
Person) Regulations 2015 (the Regulations)**

Public Sector Audit Appointments Limited (PSAA), being an appointing person for the purposes of the Regulations, invites Ribble Valley Borough Council (the authority) to become an opted in authority in accordance with the Regulations.

Further information is contained in the opt-in letter and additional information attached to this email. The length of the compulsory appointing period is the 5 consecutive financial years commencing 1 April 2018.

A decision to become an opted-in authority must be taken in accordance with the Regulations, that is by the members of an authority meeting as a whole, except where the authority is a corporation sole, such as a police and crime commissioner, in which case this decision can be taken by the holder of that office.

The closing date to give notice to PSAA of the authority's acceptance of our invitation is: **9 March 2017**.

A form of notice of acceptance is enclosed with this invitation to opt in. The notice of acceptance must be sent by email to: [appointingperson@psaa.co.uk](mailto:appointingperson@psaa.co.uk) and must be received **before 5pm on Thursday 9 March 2017**.

PSAA confirms it is willing to receive notices of acceptance by email to this address and will confirm receipt of all notices of acceptance by email.

Jon Hayes  
Chief Officer



27 October 2016

Email: [appointingperson@psaa.co.uk](mailto:appointingperson@psaa.co.uk)

Marshal Scott  
Ribble Valley Borough Council  
Council Offices  
Church Walk  
Clitheroe Lancashire BB7 2RA

Copied to: Jane Pearson, Director Of Resources, Ribble Valley Borough Council  
Diane Rice, Monitoring Officer, Ribble Valley Borough Council

Dear Mr Scott

### Invitation to opt into the national scheme for auditor appointments

As you know the external auditor for the audit of the accounts for 2018/19 has to be appointed before the end of 2017. That may seem a long way away, but as there is now a choice about how to make that appointment, a decision on your authority's approach will be needed soon.

We are pleased that the Secretary of State has expressed his confidence in us by giving us the role of appointing local auditors under a national scheme. This is one choice open to your authority. We issued a prospectus about the scheme in July 2016, available to download on the [appointing person](#) page of our website, with other information you may find helpful.

The timetable we have outlined for appointing auditors under the scheme means we now need to issue a formal invitation to opt into these arrangements. The covering email provides the formal invitation, along with a form of acceptance of our invitation for you to use if your authority decides to join the national scheme. We believe the case for doing so is compelling. To help with your decision we have prepared the additional information attached to this letter.

I need to highlight two things:

- we need to receive your formal acceptance of this invitation by 9 March 2017; and
- the relevant regulations require that, except for a body that is a corporation sole (a police and crime commissioner), the decision to accept the invitation and to opt in needs to be made by the members of the authority meeting as a whole. We appreciate this will need to be built into your decision making timetable.

If you have any other questions not covered by our information, do not hesitate to contact us by email at [appointingperson@psaa.co.uk](mailto:appointingperson@psaa.co.uk).

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Jon Hayes".

Jon Hayes, Chief Officer

PSAA, 3<sup>rd</sup> floor, Local Government House, Smith Square, London, SW1P 3HZ  
T 020 7072 7445 [www.psaa.co.uk](http://www.psaa.co.uk) Company number: 09178094

## Appointing an external auditor

### Information on the national scheme

#### Public Sector Audit Appointments Limited (PSAA)

We are a not-for-profit company established by the Local Government Association (LGA). We administer the current audit contracts, let by the Audit Commission before it closed.

We have the support of the LGA, which has worked to secure the option for principal local government and police bodies to appoint auditors through a dedicated sector-led national procurement body. We have established an advisory panel, drawn from representative groups of local government and police bodies, to give access to your views on the design and operation of the scheme.

#### The national scheme for appointing local auditors

We have been specified by the Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government as the appointing person for principal local government bodies. This means that we will make auditor appointments to principal local government bodies that choose to opt into the national appointment arrangements we will operate for audits of the accounts from 2018/19. These arrangements are sometimes described as the 'sector-led body' option, and our thinking for this scheme was set out in a prospectus circulated to you in July. The prospectus is available on the [appointing person](#) page of our website.

We will appoint an auditor for all opted-in authorities for each of the five financial years beginning from 1 April 2018, unless the Secretary of State chooses to terminate our role as the appointing person beforehand. He or she may only do so after first consulting opted-in authorities and the LGA.

#### What the appointing person scheme will offer

We are committed to making sure the national scheme will be an excellent option for auditor appointments for you.

We intend to run the scheme in a way that will save time and resources for local government bodies. We think that a collective procurement, which we will carry out on behalf of all opted-in authorities, will enable us to secure the best prices, keeping the cost of audit as low as possible for the bodies who choose to opt in, without compromising on audit quality.

Our current role means we have a unique experience and understanding of auditor procurement and the local public audit market.

Using the scheme will avoid the need for you to:

- establish an audit panel with independent members;
- manage your own auditor procurement and cover its costs;
- monitor the independence of your appointed auditor for the duration of the appointment;
- deal with the replacement of any auditor if required; and
- manage the contract with your auditor.

Our scheme will endeavour to appoint the same auditors to other opted-in bodies that are involved in formal collaboration or joint working initiatives, if you consider that a common auditor will enhance efficiency and value for money.

We will also try to be flexible about changing your auditor during the five-year appointing period if there is good reason, for example where new joint working arrangements are put in place.

Securing a high level of acceptances to the opt-in invitation will provide the best opportunity for us to achieve the most competitive prices from audit firms. The LGA has previously sought expressions of interest in the appointing person arrangements, and received positive responses from over 270 relevant authorities. We ultimately hope to achieve participation from the vast majority of eligible authorities.

### **High quality audits**

The Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 provides that firms must be registered as local public auditors with one of the chartered accountancy institutes acting in the capacity of a Recognised Supervisory Body (RSB). The quality of registered firms' work will be subject to scrutiny by both the RSB and the Financial Reporting Council (FRC), under arrangements set out in the Act.

We will:

- only contract with audit firms that have a proven track record in undertaking public audit work;
- include obligations in relation to maintaining and continuously improving quality in our contract terms and in the quality criteria in our tender evaluation;
- ensure that firms maintain the appropriate registration and will liaise closely with RSBs and the FRC to ensure that any quality concerns are detected at an early stage; and
- take a close interest in your feedback and in the rigour and effectiveness of firms' own quality assurance arrangements.

We will also liaise with the National Audit Office to help ensure that guidance to auditors is updated as necessary.

### **Procurement strategy**

In developing our procurement strategy for the contracts with audit firms, we will have input from the advisory panel we have established. The panel will assist PSAA in developing arrangements for the national scheme, provide feedback to us on proposals as they develop, and helping us maintain effective channels of communication. We think it is particularly important to understand your preferences and priorities, to ensure we develop a strategy that reflects your needs within the constraints set out in legislation and in professional requirements.

In order to secure the best prices we are minded to let audit contracts:

- for 5 years;
- in 2 large contract areas nationally, with 3 or 4 contract lots per area, depending on the number of bodies that opt in; and
- to a number of firms in each contract area to help us manage independence issues.

The value of each contract will depend on the prices bid, with the firms offering the best value being awarded larger amounts of work. By having contracts with a number of firms, we will be able to manage issues of independence and avoid dominance of the market by one or two firms. Limiting the national volume of work available to any one firm will encourage competition and ensure the plurality of provision.

### **Auditor appointments and independence**

Auditors must be independent of the bodies they audit, to enable them to carry out their work with objectivity and credibility, and in a way that commands public confidence.

We plan to take great care to ensure that every auditor appointment passes this test. We will also monitor significant proposals for auditors to carry out consultancy or other non-audit work, to protect the independence of auditor appointments.

We will consult you on the appointment of your auditor, most likely from September 2017. To make the most effective allocation of appointments, it will help us to know about:

- any potential constraints on the appointment of your auditor because of a lack of independence, for example as a result of consultancy work awarded to a particular firm;
- any joint working or collaboration arrangements that you think should influence the appointment; and
- other local factors you think are relevant to making the appointment.

We will ask you for this information after you have opted in.

Auditor appointments for the audit of the accounts of the 2018/19 financial year must be made by 31 December 2017.

### **Fee scales**

We will ensure that fee levels are carefully managed by securing competitive prices from firms and by minimising our own costs. Any surplus funds will be returned to scheme members under our articles of association and our memorandum of understanding with the Department for Communities and Local Government and the LGA.

Our costs for setting up and managing the scheme will need to be covered by audit fees. We expect our annual operating costs will be lower than our current costs because we expect to employ a smaller team to manage the scheme. We are intending to fund an element of the costs of establishing the scheme, including the costs of procuring audit contracts, from local government's share of our current deferred income. We think this is appropriate because the new scheme will be available to all relevant principal local government bodies.

PSAA will pool scheme costs and charge fees to audited bodies in accordance with a fair scale of fees which has regard to size, complexity and audit risk, most likely as evidenced by audit fees for 2016/17. Pooling means that everyone in the scheme will benefit from the most competitive prices. Fees will reflect the number of scheme participants – the greater the level of participation, the better the value represented by our scale fees.

Scale fees will be determined by the prices achieved in the auditor procurement that PSAA will need to undertake during the early part of 2017. Contracts are likely to be awarded at the end of June 2017, and at this point the overall cost and therefore the level of fees required will be clear. We expect to consult on the proposed scale of fees in autumn 2017 and to publish the fees applicable for 2018/19 in March 2018.

## Opting in

The closing date for opting in is 9 March 2017. We have allowed more than the minimum eight week notice period required, because the formal approval process for most eligible bodies, except police and crime commissioners, is a decision made by the members of an authority meeting as a whole.

We will confirm receipt of all opt-in notices. A full list of authorities who opt in will be published on our website. Once we have received an opt-in notice, we will write to you to request information on any joint working arrangements relevant to your auditor appointment, and any potential independence matters that would prevent us appointing a particular firm.

If you decide not to accept the invitation to opt in by the closing date, you may subsequently make a request to opt in, but only after 1 April 2018. The earliest an auditor appointment can be made for authorities that opt in after the closing date is therefore for the audit of the accounts for 2019/20. We are required to consider such requests, and agree to them unless there are reasonable grounds for their refusal.

## Timetable

In summary, we expect the timetable for the new arrangements to be:

- Invitation to opt in issued 27 October 2016
- Closing date for receipt of notices to opt in 9 March 2017
- Contract notice published 20 February 2017
- Award audit contracts By end of June 2017
- Consult on and make auditor appointments By end of December 2017
- Consult on and publish scale fees By end of March 2018

## Enquiries

We publish frequently asked questions on our [website](#). We are keen to receive feedback from local bodies on our plans. Please email your feedback or questions to: [appointingperson@psaa.co.uk](mailto:appointingperson@psaa.co.uk).

If you would like to discuss a particular issue with us, please send an email to the above address, and we will make arrangements either to telephone or meet you.